



**Notice of meeting of
Economic & City Development Overview & Scrutiny Committee**

To: Councillors Pierce (Chair), Hudson (Vice-Chair),
D'Agorne, Holvey, Hyman, Kirk, Potter and Scott

Date: Wednesday, 24 March 2010

Time: 3.00 pm

Venue: The Guildhall, York

AGENDA

There will be a Site Visit to Newgate Market as part of this review. This will take place before the meeting on Wednesday 24 March 2010. Members are requested to meet at The Fountain in Parliament Street at 3.00 pm.

There will be an evening Site Visit which will take place after the meeting at approximately 7.00 pm.

1. Declarations of Interest (Pages 3 - 4)
At this point Members are asked to declare any personal or prejudicial interests they may have in the business on this agenda.

2. Public Participation
It is at this point in the meeting that members of the public who have registered their wish to speak can do so. The deadline for registering is by **5pm on Tuesday 23 March 2010**. Members of the public can speak on specific planning applications or on other agenda items or matters within the remit of the committee.

To register please contact the Democracy Officer for the meeting, on the details at the foot of this agenda.

3. Newgate Market Review Report (Pages 5 - 16)
This report presents Members with information in relation to the review they are undertaking on Newgate Market.

4. Urgent Business
Any other business which the Chair considers urgent under the Local Government Act 1972

Democracy Officer:

Name- Judith Cumming
Telephone No. – 01904 551078
E-mail- judith.cumming@york.gov.uk

For more information about any of the following please contact the Democracy Officer responsible for servicing this meeting

- Registering to speak
- Business of the meeting
- Any special arrangements
- Copies of reports

About City of York Council Meetings

Would you like to speak at this meeting?

If you would, you will need to:

- register by contacting the Democracy Officer (whose name and contact details can be found on the agenda for the meeting) **no later than 5.00 pm** on the last working day before the meeting;
- ensure that what you want to say speak relates to an item of business on the agenda or an issue which the committee has power to consider (speak to the Democracy Officer for advice on this);
- find out about the rules for public speaking from the Democracy Officer.

A leaflet on public participation is available on the Council's website or from Democratic Services by telephoning York (01904) 551088

Further information about what's being discussed at this meeting

All the reports which Members will be considering are available for viewing online on the Council's website. Alternatively, copies of individual reports or the full agenda are available from Democratic Services. Contact the Democracy Officer whose name and contact details are given on the agenda for the meeting. **Please note a small charge may be made for full copies of the agenda requested to cover administration costs.**

Access Arrangements

We will make every effort to make the meeting accessible to you. The meeting will usually be held in a wheelchair accessible venue with an induction hearing loop. We can provide the agenda or reports in large print, electronically (computer disk or by email), in Braille or on audio tape. Some formats will take longer than others so please give as much notice as possible (at least 48 hours for Braille or audio tape).

If you have any further access requirements such as parking close-by or a sign language interpreter then please let us know. Contact the Democracy Officer whose name and contact details are given on the order of business for the meeting.

Every effort will also be made to make information available in another language, either by providing translated information or an interpreter providing sufficient advance notice is given. Telephone York (01904) 551550 for this service.

যদি যথেষ্ট আগে থেকে জানানো হয় তাহলে অন্য কোন অর্ধাতে তথ্য জানানোর জন্য সব ধরনের চেষ্টা করা হবে, এর জন্য দরকার হলে তথ্য অনুবাদ করে দেয়া হবে অথবা একজন দোআবী সরবরাহ করা হবে। টেলিফোন নম্বর (01904) 551 550।

Yeteri kadar önceden haber verilmesi koşuluyla, bilgilerin terümesini hazırlatmak ya da bir tercüman bulmak için mümkün olan herşey yapılacaktır. Tel: (01904) 551 550

我們竭力使提供的資訊備有不同語言版本，在有充足時間提前通知的情況下會安排筆譯或口譯服務。電話 (01904) 551 550。

اگر مناسب وقت سے اطلاع دی جاتی ہے تو ہم معلومات کا ترجمہ مہیا کرنے کی پوری کوشش کریں گے۔ ٹیلی فون (01904) 551 550

Informacja może być dostępna w tłumaczeniu, jeśli dostaniemy zapotrzebowanie z wystarczającym wyprzedzeniem. Tel: (01904) 551 550

Holding the Executive to Account

The majority of councillors are not appointed to the Executive (40 out of 47). Any 3 non-Executive councillors can 'call-in' an item of business from a published Executive (or Executive Member Decision Session) agenda. The Executive will still discuss the 'called in' business on the published date and will set out its views for consideration by a specially convened Scrutiny Management Committee (SMC). That SMC meeting will then make its recommendations to the next scheduled Executive meeting in the following week, where a final decision on the 'called-in' business will be made.

Scrutiny Committees

The purpose of all scrutiny and ad-hoc scrutiny committees appointed by the Council is to:

- Monitor the performance and effectiveness of services;
- Review existing policies and assist in the development of new ones, as necessary; and
- Monitor best value continuous service improvement plans

Who Gets Agenda and Reports for our Meetings?

- Councillors get copies of all agenda and reports for the committees to which they are appointed by the Council;
- Relevant Council Officers get copies of relevant agenda and reports for the committees which they report to;
- Public libraries get copies of **all** public agenda/reports.

MEETING OF ECONOMIC AND CITY DEVELOPMENT OVERVIEW & SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

Agenda item 1: Declarations of interest

The following Members declared standing personal interests.

Councillor Holvey- Economic Policy Advisor for Leeds City Council

Councillor D'Agorne- Employee of York College

This page is intentionally left blank



Economic & City Development Overview & Scrutiny Committee

24th March 2010

Report of the Interim Head of Civic, Legal & Democratic Services

Newgate Market Review

Summary

1. This report presents Members with information in relation to the review they are undertaking on Newgate Market. A scoping report was considered and agreed at a meeting of the Committee on 8th December and in light of this the following timetable has been prepared for today's meeting:
 - 3pm – Site visit (meet at the fountain in Parliament Street at 3pm)
 - 4.30pm (approximate) – Meeting at the Guildhall to receive a presentation from the Principal City Development Officer, a presentation from a representative of the National Association of British Market Authorities (NABMA) and a briefing paper regarding the income of Newgate Market
 - 7pm (approximate) – Evening Site Visit

Background

2. At a meeting of the Economic & City Development Overview & Scrutiny Committee held on 14th July 2009 Members received the 2008/09 Outturn Report – Finance & Performance. This reported a shortfall in income at Newgate Market following a trend of reduced stall take up and a national decline in the popularity of open markets. Discussions on this report ensued and it was agreed that the Committee would like further information on Newgate Market. A briefing note was prepared and presented to Members of the Committee at their meeting on 29th September 2009.
3. This briefing note was discussed and the key themes and discussion points are attached at Annex A to this report and entitled information received to date.
4. In coming to a decision to review this topic; the Economic & City Development Overview & Scrutiny Committee recognised certain key objectives and the following remit was agreed.

Aim

To investigate possible ways of improving the existing stall market and its surrounding area currently occupied by Newgate Market as a contribution to the Renaissance Team's work and the Footstreets Review, enabling them to recommend new designs and roles for Newgate Market and the associated public realm.

Key Objectives

- i. To receive information from the Renaissance Team about its work plan; particularly in relation to Newgate Market.
- ii. To investigate comparators to Newgate Market (what makes a good market, what constitutes good practice)
- iii. To investigate potential immediate, short and long term development of, improvements to and usages of this area
- iv. To look at the income generated by Newgate Market.

Context of Review

5. The future of Newgate Market is being formally considered as part of the statutory Local Development Framework (LDF) through its daughter document the City Centre Area Action Plan (CCAAP). With an agreed remit to feed into the CCAAP, a Renaissance Team has been established by the City of York Council and Yorkshire Forward (who are providing the finance) to investigate and put forward proposals in relation to the city centre public realm. This will not just focus on spatial/design issues but will address what uses might be encouraged, by whom and at what time of day.
6. Also underway is the Footstreets Review, which is looking at how Newgate is accessed at different times of the day. As with CCAAP, consultation on the review is already underway with city centre businesses already looking forward to the next stage of the review.

Consultation

7. Relevant officers within the Economic Development Unit have been consulted as part of the review process.
8. Further interested parties will be consulted as the review progresses and a representative from the National Association of British Market Authorities (NABMA) will be attending the meeting today.

Timetable and Further Information

9. The timetable for today's meeting will be as follows:

3pm – Site Visit to Newgate Market

10. The City Centre Manager will give a short introduction about Newgate Market to Members of the Committee before showing them around the market area.

4.30pm – The meeting

11. Members of the Committee are requested to return to the Guildhall to discuss the site visit and to receive information on the following:

- i. Presentation from the Principal City Development Officer outlining the recent progress on the economic masterplan and vision work, as currently being developed through Professor Alan Simpson and his team, and funded by Yorkshire Forward. The presentation will also outline the outcomes from the recent charrette weekend (where over 100 hundred people were invited to hear about the work of the renaissance panel and to join in working groups) and options for the future of Newgate market will be discussed.

Professor Simpson is acting as a critical friend on the CCAAP. The city development team has previously consulted on options for Newgate market through an issues and options report, and we will give feedback on the key messages from that consultation. It will also outline the 'placecheck' approach, in terms of assessment of places.

- ii. Presentation from a representative of NABMA on what makes a good market and examples of good practice
- iii. Briefing Papers (Annexes B & C to this report refer) to be presented by the City Centre Manager on the income of Newgate Market

7pm (approximately) – Site Visit

12. Members of the Committee will be asked to return to Newgate Market, with the City Centre Manager, to see the area at night, after the market traders have left for the day.

Options

13. Members are asked to note the information received today and;

- i. Consider whether they would like to hold a public event to seek views from the market traders and members of the public who use the market
- ii. Consider scheduling another meeting to consider a draft final report and to formulate the recommendations arising from the review.

Analysis

14. Members are requested to consider the information received at today's meeting with a view to formulating some recommendations to include in a draft final report at a future meeting.

15. In a scoping report dated 8th December 2009 Members agreed to hold a public event. The idea of this was to talk to market traders and market users to receive their ideas and views for the future of the area. It was suggested

that this be a combined event with the Renaissance Team who have already stated their desire to consult with city centre business interests. In light of the information received today and the work the Renaissance Team have already undertaken the Committee are asked to decide if such an event is still necessary and if so, what value this could add to the review.

Corporate Priorities

16. This report and the scrutiny topic on Newgate Market are linked with the Thriving City theme of the Corporate Strategy 2009/2012:

‘We will continue to support York’s successful economy to make sure that employment rates remain high and that local people benefit from new job opportunities.’

17. It also touches on elements of the Sustainable City and Effective Organisation themes in the recently refreshed Corporate Strategy 2009/2012.

Implications

18. **Financial** – There is a small amount of funding available within the scrutiny budget to carry out reviews. There are no other financial implications associated with this report however; implications may arise as the review progresses.

19. **Human Resources** – There are no Human Resources implications associated with the recommendations within this report.

20. **Legal** – There are no legal implications associated with this report however, implications may arise as the review progresses.

21. There are no known equalities, property, crime & disorder or other implications associated with the recommendations within this report.

Risk Management

22. In compliance with the Council’s risk management strategy there are no known risks associated with the recommendations in this report.

Recommendations

23. Members are asked to:

- i. Note the information received today
- ii. Consider whether they would like to hold a public event to seek views from the market traders and members of the public who use the market
- iii. Consider scheduling another meeting to consider a draft final report and to formulate the recommendations arising from the review.

Reason: To progress this review.

Contact Details

Author:

Tracy Wallis
Scrutiny Officer
Scrutiny Services
Tel: 01904 551714

Chief Officer Responsible for the report:

Alison Lowton
Interim Head of Civic, Legal & Democratic
Services
Tel: 01904 551004

Report Approved

Date 16.03.2010

Specialist Implications Officer(s) None

Wards Affected: Guildhall Ward

All

For further information please contact the author of the report

Background Papers:

Newgate Market – Focus Report – 29th September 2009
Scoping Report – Newgate Market – 8th December 2009

Annexes

Annex A Information Received to Date
Annex B Briefing Note – Newgate Market
Annex C Newgate Market Tolls

This page is intentionally left blank

Information Received to Date

1. At a meeting on 29th September 2009 Members of the Committee were presented with a briefing note, which provided an overview of trading conditions at Newgate Market as a result of the present economic climate. The main points of the briefing note are set out below:
 - There has been a marked effect on outdoor markets due to changes in customer expectations. This has resulted in a downturn of trader takings, stall occupancy and ultimately rental income to local authorities.
 - Newgate Market has fared fairly well compared with many open markets in the region but there is still concern that trade will decline. Managers have introduced a range of innovative measures to mitigate the effects of changing shopping patterns. These have been designed to ease the trader's economic circumstances and to raise the market's profile.
 - A new fees and charges structure has been introduced based on supply and demand. The layout of the market has been revised and some stalls withdrawn to open up new, more inviting aisles. In addition new 'building out' guidelines were introduced.
 - New generic backdrop vinyl 'nameboards' were made available (at a subsidised cost) in order to make the market look more uniform and professional.
 - A brochure was designed to promote the market and this was delivered to every household in York as well as being available at the library and some cafes in York. The cost of the brochure was funded by advertising within it.
 - Various promotion events were held including a live broadcast by Minster FM, a 'Love your Local Market' month, a 'markets on the move' roadshow, visits to local schools, a revamped *Trader Times* newsletter and reduced parking fees for traders' vehicles.
2. Consideration of the briefing note led Members to discuss the following themes:
 - The City Centre Action Plan and the vision for the area
 - Properties on the Shambles and how they relate to Newgate Market
 - The effect of the continental markets in Parliament Street on stalls within the market
 - Immediate, short & longer term developments in the area (including possible future usages of the area)
 - The possibility of receiving information giving a more comparative stance, for example 'what makes a good market?' and examples of good practice.

This page is intentionally left blank

**Economic & City Development Overview & Scrutiny
Committee
Briefing Note – Newgate Market**

Site Visits and Discussion – 24 March 2010

Background Paper re key objective (iv):

1. Key Objective (iv) as determined by Scrutiny Committee at their meeting on 8 December 2009 states: *to look at income generated by Newgate Market*
2. 'Actual' income has fallen short of 'target' (base budget) for a number of years now following a trend of reduced stall take up and a national decline in the popularity of open markets. This was outlined in the two previous Scoping Reports on Newgate Market.
3. A number of initiatives were introduced by Markets Management in 2009 to address this decline and detailed at the Scrutiny Committee of 29 September 2009. Many of those initiatives have proved successful and as such the shortfall in 2009/10 is anticipated much less than in previous years, as outlined in paragraph 4. below.

4. Year	Budget	Actual	Shortfall
2005/06	532,060	494,720	37,340
2006/07	516,640	494,733	21,907
2007/08	543,750	481,672	62,078
2008/09	501,750	412,689	89,061
2009/10	476,580	448,500 (est.)	31,500 (est)

5. It is anticipated a 'rent freeze' for Newgate Market fees for 2010/11, a revised (more realistic) base budget, plus consideration of further initiatives, will help Markets Management achieve their target in the coming financial year.

This page is intentionally left blank

PROPOSED 2010/11**NEWGATE MARKET TOLLS**

DAY	ZONE	AVERAGE OCCUPANCY	Current Fee	Proposed Fee	Increase over
			2009/10	2010/11	2009/10 (+ or -)
MONDAY	A	95.0%	17.00	17.00	Nil
	B	95.0%	15.00	15.00	Nil
	C	78.0%	10.00	10.00	Nil
	D	25.0%	6.00	6.00	Nil
	E - o/s	78.0%	18.00	18.00	Nil
	F - o/s	100.0%	40.00	40.00	Nil

DAY	ZONE	AVERAGE OCCUPANCY	Current Fee	Proposed Fee	Increase over
			2009/10	2010/11	2009/10 (+ or -)
FRIDAY	A	95.0%	25.00	25.00	Nil
	B	95.0%	24.00	24.00	Nil
	C	75.0%	22.00	22.00	Nil
	D	50.0%	13.00	13.00	Nil
	E - o/s	78.0%	20.00	20.00	Nil
	F - o/s	100.0%	40.00	40.00	Nil

TUESDAY	A	95.0%	21.00	21.00	Nil
	B	95.0%	19.50	19.50	Nil
	C	70.0%	17.00	17.00	Nil
	D	30.0%	12.00	12.00	Nil
	E - o/s	78.0%	20.00	20.00	Nil
	F - o/s	100.0%	40.00	40.00	Nil

SATURDAY	A	100.0%	33.00	33.00	Nil
	B	100.0%	30.00	30.00	Nil
	C	78.0%	24.50	24.50	Nil
	D	50.0%	21.00	21.00	Nil
	E - o/s	78.0%	20.00	20.00	Nil
	F - o/s	100.0%	45.00	45.00	Nil

WEDNESDAY	A	95.0%	20.00	20.00	Nil
	B	95.0%	18.00	18.00	Nil
	C	70.0%	16.00	16.00	Nil
	D	30.0%	11.00	11.00	Nil
	E - o/s	78.0%	20.00	20.00	Nil
	F - o/s	100.0%	40.00	40.00	Nil

SUNDAY	A	100.0%	23.00	23.00	Nil
	B	100.0%	22.00	22.00	Nil
	C	78.0%	19.00	19.00	Nil
	D	30.0%	7.00	7.00	Nil
	E - o/s	75.0%	20.00	20.00	Nil
	F - o/s	100.0%	40.00	40.00	Nil

THURSDAY	A	100.0%	22.00	22.00	Nil
	B	95.0%	21.50	21.50	Nil
	C	75.0%	19.00	19.00	Nil
	D	50.0%	11.00	11.00	Nil
	E - o/s	78.0%	20.00	20.00	Nil
	F - o/s	100.0%	40.00	40.00	Nil

KEY :-

A	Jubbergate
B	Prime Stalls
C	Standard Stalls
D	Rear Stalls
E - o/s	Open spaces pitches
F - o/s	Brunch Wagon

Event Markets	Current Fee 2009/10	Proposed Fee	Increase over 2009/10 (+ or -)	Effect on total Income
	£	£	£	£
Easter Fayre Market	100	100	0	
St Nicholas Fayre - Parliament Street	150	155	5	
St Nicholas Fayre - Kings Square/Coppergate	100	100	0	4,000
St Nicholas Fayre - Guildhall	30	30	0	
Misc. Events (Farmers, York's Day ,Cont. etc)	various	various		
TOTAL ADDITIONAL INCOME (EVENT MARKETS)				4,000
CASUAL MARKET TRADERS - levy	2.00	2.00	0.00	0
Parking Waivers (applicable during footstreet hours)	20.00	20.00	0	0

This page is intentionally left blank